

The 11th ifva Animation Category Jury Panel Comments

Jurors: WONG Ying, LO Che-ying, Henry MA, Eddy WONG, Elphonso LAM

Mum is Born

WONG Ying: A work strong in personal style and highly individualized, it is beautiful in frame design, with minimal effect/score and interesting scene/narrative details.

Together with the smooth decoupage/narrative it is almost perfect! But the dialogue balloon design weakens its sense of depth, a cinematic experience (not 3-dimensional) made up of sight and sound, which intrigues and draws the viewers to know, understand and feel it. Of course, it may be deliberate.

The creator intends to keep the viewers at a distance. But by its very nature, the animated world is not what we can relate to. It may work better for such an individualized work to involve the viewers more.

Personally I want more footage on the sister. The brother is busy doing household chores, going to evening school or entering drawing competition. We know the sister works to support the family (breadwinner?) But what does she do? It is not easy to support a family; we want more details. Taking care of a family member with mental issues (amnesia/mentally challenged/senile dementia) is a hard and painful responsibility. The mother after injury is like a newborn baby, totally irrational and totally helpless. The young siblings have to take up the mother's role; they have no help and no support. Do we want to live in such a society? The brother's name Fong Mau is a pun for absurd. An absurd society that is red in tooth and claw.

LO Che-ying: Special subject matter, it is an ambitious work outstanding in artistic execution and animation. The subject matter is not easy to work on and replacing dialogues with "word balloons" is one of the options.

Henry MA: Simple story meticulous in composition, the narration and visual arrangement work hand in hand. It is rich in cinematic language and has made full use of the animation elements.

Making Love With PA

LO Che-ying: The animation and art design work hand-in-glove with the subject matter. It is one of the most outstanding animations in style and standard. The dialogue is carefully crafted and the interpretation is OK!

Henry MA: The story is simple in structure and the characters do not stand out. But the presentation is unique.

Eddy WONG: My first impression is that it is noisy. The young main character, the stubborn father, and the mother with her words you can never understand, they make up a crowd. But this family is very typical, very real. With his cartoon paper-cutting, the director brings his real life story to the audience. Family means sharing and giving. I am sure it touches a very responsive chord.

Beautiful Shore

WONG Ying: The title comes from the psalm 'If We Never Meet Again', which is also the theme song of the work. The poignant lyric contrasts the transient sadness of parting with the eternity of the beautiful shore; that is heaven. The simple and pure images, together with the ethereal song, take us for a journey of the soul in this sensuous MV. The blooming of roses in the middle part looks like Chinese lotus. For a brief moment it seems East and West, Buddhism and Christianity, have merged into one. But framing lacks variation or creativity and some animated parts are too rough. The too detailed heaven allows no room for imagination.

LO Che-ying: The animation effect is rather ordinary, but the art design is quite outstanding.

Henry MA: An animation that complements the music but it has nothing to recommend itself. It has not made full of the animation

Moldy Media

LO Che-ying: Overall speaking, it is a work of high standard, but the theme can go further. The media is quite a common animation subject matter; the impact would be greater if it dared to push the envelope further. The watercolour effect is very impressive.

Henry MA: It has a subject matter but not a clear-cut theme. The presentation is fun though what is being conveyed is ambiguous.

Memories Fade

LO Che-ying: Rather good in artistic effect and the interpretation of memory is quite fun.

Henry MA: A conceptualized story that is not complete, it is more like an essay. It tries to convey the ideas through visual image. It can use better animation techniques but the visual symbols are outstanding.

Eddy WONG: Animation doesn't have to be in technicolor, sometimes monochrome is more forceful and a better tool for conveying message, like the work. Through simple but unique character design and the sepia tone, memories we have lost forgotten are recalled and retages.

Deathless Bird

LO Che-ying: A very interesting subject matter and the animation and artistic effect have done their job. But there are areas that could be better, such as more animation.

Henry MA: An experimental animation with tons of visual effect, but it fails to convey the story clearly.

Companion

LO Che-ying: The animation effect and art design are quite good, but the score is a bit weak. The result would be better if a subtler approached was used instead.

Henry MA: This is an animation professional in technical execution but not creative enough in presentation.

Eddy WONG: Remarkable animation techniques and captivating frames are my first impression of this work. With forceful framing, editing and visual effects, the director is able to convey the relationship between the Lord and His people in the frames. It is a visual treat, with a strong message.

Optimism

WONG Ying: We all have our own burden to bear, but how should we face it? The responsibilities of the young and the old are different. The director is optimistic here. Feel free to relate to your age group. Simple idea, fun visual design and style, with a fine grasp of body language. But there is room for improvement in facial expression, trimming and action and object movement. Attention should be paid to shading; without it, the stone boxes don't seem to have weight.

LO Che-ying: Some images are not bad, with the weakest link being the character design.

Henry MA: An oppressive visual world, the work is able to convey a strong and powerful sense through set design, picture manipulation and camera movement, but rather ambiguous in its overall meaning.

Instant Jack

LO Che-ying: A rather uncommon subject matter and the overall design, animation and art design complement one another. In some cases, the work manages to turn local materials into rich ideas.

Henry MA: Strange visuals, but the story is rather weak, and the animation fails to convey what the message behind the story.

Mimosa

LO Che-ying: The animation is may be simple, but the character and art design gives the work its unique style, which leaves a deep impression on the viewers.

Henry MA: A work very sincere in intention, but the presentation fails to bring out the main points.

Eddy WONG: The title may sound like a documentary about a certain plant, but it is actually an animation about autism. Sha...sha...is the noise from a faulty TV and the communication obstacle that cuts the autistic from the outside world. Through a simple and unpolished style, the director reveals the world of the autistic.

The Well in the 80s'

LO Che-ying: The animation has room for improvement, but the overall standard is not bad, showing its own style. The presentation suits its nostalgic taint and the public housing building turned playground exudes a unique ambience.

Henry MA: The animation technique is immature, but frame composition, artistic design and scene and visual arrangement do vividly show the feelings the creator bears the "well" and it resonates with the viewers.

Eddy WONG: With childlike imagination, the author takes us back to public housing courtyard which was our childhood playground. The hopscotch was our Jacob's ladder to happiness. It is childhood revisited, a bit dreamlike.

Backbone Medley

LO Che-ying: It is a refreshing work overall, with outstanding sound effect. Very “animated”.

Henry MA: The presentation is appealing; it lives up to the creator’s claim of “combining sound and sight to create an unreal but believable world”. However, the narrative fails to strike a chord or bring out the theme in full.

Who Cares

LO Che-ying: A very picturesque work and high in overall standard, the male voiceover, however, is a bit weak. The production is up to professional standard and the topic has local characteristic.

Henry MA: Smooth animation technique and impressive frame design, but the story fails to bring out the message behind the work.

A Mid-night Story

WONG Ying: A funny piece of work. The personification of the pushcart is well executed. The narration is simple and smooth. The atmosphere of Shum Shui Po/Tai Kok Tsui at night is vivid. The old man’s design is weak in comparison. The arrangement is not bad overall but a bit rushed. There is room for improvement in decoupage. Pushcart and garbage truck is David and Goliath, but making the impossible possible is what cartoons are for. It is exaggerated, it is anti-intellectual, it is unrealistic, it is fun.

LO Che-ying: Good ambience and animation effect, but the content is too thin. Still, as a 3-D animation, the execution is the best among this year’s lot.

Henry LO: Mature animation technique, creative animation topic and smooth animation production, what is lacking here is personal style. The presentation could be better.

Animation Category

Gold Award

Mum is Born

John CHAN

Silver Award

Making Love with PA

WONG Wai-hang

The Well In 80s

CHAU Pak-ho

Special Mention

A Mid-Night Story

WONG Hoi-chung

Who Cares

TSUI Ka-hei, TSUI Ka-long, CHAN Siu-chung

Backbone Medley

LEE Ki-bun